

## **PROVINCIAL COUNCIL MINUTES**

**If members of your community do not have access to email, please consider printing a set of these minutes for their benefit.**

**But please remember that these minutes deal with confidential matters and are intended to be seen by members of the PCM Province only. If you are printing these minutes out, please make sure they are kept in a secure place.**

**Provincial Council Meeting Minutes**  
**Our Lady of Mount Carmel – Osprey, FL**  
**May 2-4, 2017**  
**Telephone Conference Call – May 13, 2017**

The provincial council thanks the communities of Our Lady of Mount Carmel, Osprey, Carmel at Mission Valley, Nokomis, and St. Raphael in Englewood for their hospitality and good cheer. On a personal note, this council is particularly grateful to these Carmelites as they welcomed us for our first meeting as a council in 2014, and again for the final meeting in 2017.

**Reports from**  
**Commissions/Board Meetings of Affiliated Organizations**

**Finance Commission**  
**February 7, 2017**

The minutes from the February 7, 2017 meeting were presented to the council, as well as several updates from the Little Flower Society, the Paramus Mall, the Mahwah property, the priory renovation project in Encino, CA, the 403(b) employee plan for the employees of the Provincial Office, and potential settlements.

**Review Board**  
**February 22, 2017**

William Harry updated the council on several items from the minutes of the February 22, 2017 meeting. A later meeting of the Board was dedicated to reviewing the proposed updated version of the manual *Policies for Maintaining Ethical Ministries with Minors and Vulnerable Adults*. Myron Judy, Delegate for Praesidium, and Emmett Gavin, Provincial Canonist, wrote the final version which will be approved later in the meeting.

The evaluation team from Praesidium visited the province and sent their report. Most of the deficiencies have been addressed. In August they will visit the Peruvian Commissariat. Reaccreditation will come after that.

In keeping with general practice and at the suggestion of the Review Board, the “Misconduct Review Board” will be called “The Review Board.”

**Carmelitana Collection Board Meeting**  
**March 3, 2017**

The council reviewed the minutes from the March 3, 2017 meeting of the newly reconstituted Board. Several updates were given related to the Rogge Fund agreement,

physical plant needs of the library, the website, the on-line presence of the collection, as well as the 2017-2018 budget.

The Rogge Fund does not fully cover the annual budget needs of the library; therefore other funding is required. After discussion of possible revenue sources, including the assistance of the provincial office, a motion was made.

**Motion: Upon the sale of the Mahwah Retreat property, Paul Henson moved to set aside \$2 million from the proceeds of the Mahwah property sale for the sole purpose of supporting the Carmelitana Collection. An account will be created for the named purpose, and only the interest from the principal investment could be withdrawn for the needs of the Collection. Emilio Rodriguez seconded the motion. All were in favor. The motion carried.**

### **Secondary Schools Commission**

**March 6-8, 2017**

The council reviewed the minutes from the March 6-8, 2017 Secondary Schools Commission. Topics discussed included: sponsorship, general school policies, marketing and enrollment best practices, the International Secondary Schools gathering in Rome, and the newly revised 2017 Carmelite Secondary Schools Manual. The commission bid farewell and thank you to Crespi's Principal, Jonathan Schild, who will be leaving Crespi in June 2017.

### **Carmelite Institute of North America Board**

**March 16, 2017**

The minutes of the March 16, 2017 meeting were presented. Some notable highlights include: the days of recollection being held around the country; the webinars which continue to attract high numbers of participants; the symposium organizers who are working on increasing the number of registered participants; and the selection of the new president was tabled for a future meeting.

Efforts are being made to engage the Board members and the Lay Carmelites to increase publicity and participation at events being offered. A publicity committee will be formed to bring some needed expertise.

### **Parish Commission**

**March 22, 2017**

The minutes of the March 22, 2017 meeting were reviewed. The commission provided four scenarios for the possible restructuring of regions and parishes. While there may be other

possibilities, the commission moved the discussion forward and presented a plan based on the results of the parish survey.

The council also reviewed a proposal for a Parish Coordinator who would be charged with visiting each of the parishes and providing feedback to the council. The Council was in favor of the idea but feels that many of the tasks listed in the proposal really are the dioceses' responsibilities. However, the idea of a coordinator helping with those that are the province's responsibility would be a step forward.

The council commends the commission for their diligence, hard work, and sensitivity to these matters.

### **Vocation Commission** **March 23, 2017**

The council discussed a legislative proposal introduced by the Vocations Commission that reads, "*The Vocation Ministry of the Province of the Most Pure Heart of Mary will have outreach efforts in Canada, the United States (respective of the territorial guidelines established in cooperation with the Province of St. Elias and defined in the Vocations Manual), Mexico, Central America and Peru.*"

The change reflects the desire of El Salvador to begin thinking of a Central American reality rather than just El Salvador. This is the common practice among other religious orders and was strongly recommended to us in discussions with the Archbishop of San Salvador.

The council asks the Formation Commission to include this proposal in the current operating Formation Manual for approval of the council and ratification by the chapter members.

### **Formation Commission** **March 24-25, 2017**

The minutes of the March 24-25, 2017 meeting were reviewed. The council spent a significant amount of time reiterating the reasons for inviting Latin American students to the USA for English and the novitiate. The provincial council has already stated these reasons in the provincial council minutes of April 2016, June 2016, and November-December 2016.

### **Latin American students: English Language Program and Novitiate Experience**

*There are two novitiates in the province: New York and Peru. While the experiences are very different, both experiences are of equal value in the eyes of the Council. The reason students from Mexico are going to the novitiate in the USA is that it runs from June to June. Peru's novitiate begins in January and ends the following January. Both novitiates provide greater*

*exposure to the province, the membership and cultures. Mexican students have the option, in discussion with the Mexican formator and the provincial, to do their novitiate in Peru or USA. If they request English language studies, they will spend generally one (1) year at Carith House learning English in an approved university program, and then proceed to the Middletown. If they feel they are not proficient enough in English, they can request Peru.*

*Students in Mexico who operate within the North American academic calendar can easily transition into the USA novitiate which is held from June to June. Students in El Salvador, who operate within the South American academic calendar, would normally attend the novitiate in Peru which is from January to January. A student from El Salvador who is assigned to an internship in the United States will do English language studies at a school in Chicago while living at Carith House while waiting for a religious worker visa. When the religious worker visa is received, the professed student will then proceed to his assigned ministry in the United States.*

*An English speaking student (who is fluent in Spanish) can request to do his novitiate in Peru, in consultation with the provincial and formator, taking into account his US academic calendar.*

### **Lay Carmelites** **March 27-29, 2017**

The minutes from the March 27-29, 2017 meeting were presented to the council. Several updates were highlighted; namely, the 2019 Symposium Convocation, the revision of the interprovincial statutes, and the publication of the next edition of "Climbing the Mountain" which is used as a formation manual for Phase II instruction.

As discussed before, Sr. Mary Martin retired and Cindy Perazzo, a Lay Carmelite from Fairfield, CA, has begun working as the provincial coordinator.

### **Carmelite Media Department** **April 5, 2017**

The minutes of the April 5, 2017 meeting were presented to the council. The department continues to expand its projects and is making efforts to expand its work with outside organizations. The "Laudato Si" Curriculum of the Carmelite NGO is being published by Carmelite Media.

A number of book publications are in process. Foundations Stones is being translated into Spanish and may be ready by the 2017 Chapter. The office is preparing for the publication of two new books authored by 2 PCM Carmelites, and the next issue of *The Sword*.

## **Board of Directors – Darien Spiritual Center**

**April 6, 2017**

The minutes of the April 6, 2017 meeting were reviewed. Updates were given on the status of campus employee handbooks, the financials for the center, and some personnel matters.

Because of an increased number of people using the Spiritual Center and more efficient operations, the annual subsidy from the province to the Spiritual Center is expected to drop from \$240,000 to \$24,000 for the coming year.

The Spiritual Center still owes \$2.1 million on the remodeling of Carefree Village into the Spiritual center. The provincial council was asked to consider reducing this loan as there is little possibility of repayment.

**Motion: Joseph Atcher made a motion to use the difference between the past subsidy of \$240,000 and the subsidy in coming years as payment of the loan of \$2.1 million. Samuel Citero seconded the motion. The motion unanimously approved the council.**

## **Board of Directors – Provincial Development Board**

**April 6, 2017**

The purpose of this board is to provide more coordination for fundraising efforts by the PCM Province. The team consists of the provincial, the provincial treasurer, and the Directors of the Little Flower Society, the League of the Infant of Prague, and the Carmelite Mission Office.

The Board received a request from the provincial of the Australian-East Timorese Province that the PCM Province be an “agent” that requests funding from US charities in order to send money to foreign (outside the US) charitable entities. Previously John Malley did this. However, we do not feel that we have anyone at this time who has interest in doing this. We also believe that there would be problems with issuing.

There was a request from Sean Keefe that the province issue tax receipts to those who are giving him money for the missions in Timor Leste. We believe issuing such receipts would cause problems. We therefore decline to do this.

We have also become aware that some have come into the PCM province to raise funds for their province without the knowledge of the PCM provincial. The provincial will contact the provinces involved.

Robert Colaresi has begun some exploratory work for the possibility of establishing a fundraising effort focused on the Mexico City area.

Repayment of the loan the province made to the parish in Torreon for the construction of the new church building has begun. Approximately \$20,000 per year is being paid on a loan of \$860,000. We thank the parish for honoring their commitment to the province.

**Darien Ministry Administration Team (MAT)**  
**April 10, 2017**

The Darien Ministry Administration Team was organized to bring some common focus to all of the ministries on the Darien campus. Although each ministry is distinct, all need to work together to provide the very best experience to the many visitors to the campus.

The minutes of the April 10, 2017 were reviewed. Personnel handbooks and benefits, Whitefriars Hall, update on the Shrine of the Little Flower, and 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter financials were discussed.

**Meeting of the Chapter Preparatory Commission**  
**April 4-5, 2017**

The minutes from the April 4-5, 2017 meeting were presented to the council. Several updates were provided: changes to the schedule, the gifts (stoles for the ordained and leather satchels for the anniversary of vows), presentations (CARA and CUA), and the 3 reflection/discussion sessions.

## **Communications**

### **From the Peruvian Commissariat**

Two communiqués from the Peruvian Commissariat were reviewed: the minutes from the April 6, 2017 Commissary Council Meeting, and an email from Miguel Baccigalupo.

They provided general updates on the men and the ministries. Notably James Geaney will no longer be living and working in Pucusana.

## **Community Visits / Community House Calls**

### **Calls to the Community**

Reports were given on the status of the men around the province. The men in ministry continue to be busy with ministry activities, post-Easter sacraments, and end of the school

year events. Property renovations at Encino and new ministry possibilities at St. Cecilia are going smoothly and bringing energy to the Carmelite residents.

Reports from around the province indicate that most men are attending the 2017 chapter.

Asked about whether the phone calls or emails provide an effective way of communicating between the membership and the council, many men were satisfied with this form of communication, yet some expressed that the one-to-one engagement between the leadership and the men was lacking.

### **Provincial Visit to Casa del Carmen – Tlalpan, Mexico**

**March 9-16, 2017**

The provincial visited Mexico City from March 9-16 for 2 reasons: to meet personally with the students in formation and assess their studies and community life, and to participate in the vocation retreat. Some of the young men on the retreat will be applying for admission to the pre-novitiate program.

### **Provincial Visit to Whitefriars Hall**

**March 1-4, 2017**

From March 1-4, 2017, the provincial visited Whitefriars Hall, Washington, DC. He met individually with the students in formation, including those who will be going on internship in the coming year. On March 3, he was present for the House Chapter to discuss a petition for diaconate ordination and 2 solemn professions.

On March 2, 2017, Jack Welch, Brad Petersen (via teleconference) and the provincial met with a team of administrators from the Catholic University of America Theology Department to further discuss the creation of a Chair in Carmelite Spirituality.

### **Provincial Visits to Carith House**

**March 5, 2017**

**April 7, 2017**

The provincial visited Carith House on March 5, 2017 to meet with several of the students and to spend an evening of prayer, conversation, and to have dinner with the community.

On April 7, 2017, the provincial met individually with the four students who petitioned for entrance into the novitiate. All four students were approved for admission to the novitiate in Middletown.

He also visited Tom Murphy who is on sabbatical at Catholic Theological Union in the Hesburgh Program to discuss the program and Tom's future assignment.



**Provincial Visit to El Salvador**  
**March 7-12, 2017**

The provincial visited El Salvador from March 7-12, 2017 to meet with the students at Centro Xiberta, to receive the solemn profession of Benjamin Salas, and to attend the annual meeting of Carmelites in El Salvador.

Miguel Angel Chevez from MACH Consultores, facilitated the annual meeting of Carmelites. All of the professed members in El Salvador, including the interns on assignment (via teleconference) reviewed the progress of the strategic plan and updated the 3-5 year goals. Much progress has been made toward achieving the strategic plan goals.

**Provincial Visit to Our Lady of Mount Carmel Parish**  
**April 19, 2017**

A visitation of Our Lady of Mount Carmel Church, Tenafly, NJ occurred on April 19, 2017. The provincial met with the pastor Dan O'Neill, and Emmett Gavin.

**Provincial Visit to St. Anastasia Parish**  
**April 21, 2017**

The provincial visited the community on April 21, 2017 and discussed several issues that are impacting the community. Unfortunately Eugene Bettinger was away but the provincial was able to meet with him a few days before.

**9-Month Middletown Novitiate Evaluation**  
**April 19, 2017**

On April 19, 2017, the provincial visited with Roberto Mejia, the PCM novice for his 9-month evaluation.

Because Roberto was unable to leave Mexico when his passport and visa were stolen during the robbery at the Tlalpan formation house, he will not be professed with his class. So no one from PCM will be professing on June 12. Four pre-novices will be received into the novitiate on June 11.

## **Continuing Business**

### **Update on Housing for Carmelites at Crespi**

The priory renovation project is progressing well. An architect has been hired to create a design concept for the portion of the house that is being renovated. The community will need to find alternative housing during the construction. That is currently being investigated. The project will cost approximately \$500,000.00 and needs to be designed in such a way that the school can utilize the space if the time comes that there are no more Carmelites residing at the school.

### **Update on Vocation Ministry**

Vocation reports from the USA/Canada, Mexico and El Salvador were reviewed by the council. Mexico is projecting to have 5-6 students enter the pre-novitiate in the coming year. An admissions board conference call will be set up. El Salvador continues communicating with inquirers from all over Central America and hosting men for community visitations. They project to have 3 students entering the pre-novitiate program.

Canada/United States continues working with inquirers and planning visitation days to Carith House. The number of projected pre-novices entering the program is 1-3.

### **Update on Avon House Renovations**

A revised proposal for the renovations of the shore house was presented to the council. Additional work was needed once the project started. However, the project seems to have been unnecessarily delayed. We have been told the projected completion date is May 31, 2017.

### **Update on Paramus Mall Situation**

The Mall decided to lease the property we were using as a chapel to another group. The Carmelites have left the mall and the equipment and inventory is in storage. We have been searching for a new location in the same area but have been unable to find anything with a reasonable rent. The material in storage will be disposed of.

The Council thanks Eugene Bettinger for his ministry at the Paramus Mall these many years and for his efforts to secure a new location.

## **Update on Mahwah Property**

The Carmel Retreat property is in contract now and is expected to sell during the summer of 2017. We need to make a couple of modifications to the property before it can be sold. This work is in progress.

## **Praesidium Related Matters**

Several updates were given to the council related to Praesidium. The Praesidium team plans to visit Peru in August 2017 to discuss safe environment standards.

Every year the provincial is now required to give the province a verbal or written presentation about the concerns and efforts towards providing safe environments.

The council dedicated a significant amount of time to reviewing the proposed revision of the *Policies for Maintaining Ethical Ministries with Minors and Vulnerable Adults*. The revised manual will be distributed during the Provincial Chapter, if it can be finalized and printed by then. Those not attending the Chapter will receive their copy by mail.

## **Policy for Listing Members in Electronic & Published Directory**

The council was asked to develop a policy for the listing of members in our directories.

“Any member accused of misconduct with a child or vulnerable adult will have their picture and residential address removed from the Provincial directories to preserve the privacy of the accused and others in residence. “

This is the current policy, although it was not always followed. This policy has been interpreted by some as being punitive, as an indication that this member is no longer fully a member of the province. That is not the case. We remove this information in an attempt to protect the member and those in his community. Incidents can be cited, the most serious being a short film of a member leaving his house and being followed while he is driving. The film and commentary were then uploaded to the internet.

We know that our directories are used by a variety of people. They are left out in the open. Nothing on the internet seems secure. So we take this step to insure our men are safer, although we realize it is not a guarantee.

## **Update on Carmelite Chair of Spirituality at CUA**

Jack Welch, a member of the ad-hoc committee investigating the Carmelite Chair at Catholic University of America, and the provincial council discussed some key elements of the proposal for a Chair, including the possibility of a Carmelite Center which would provide a host of projects in Carmelite studies at CUA.

The council's position is to first establish a Carmelite Chair of Spirituality using the \$3.5 million allocated for this project from the funds received from the closure of the Washington Theological Union. In time, the program could expand to include a Carmelite Center which would require additional funding.

A presentation laying out the various aspects of this venture will be made at the June 2017 chapter.

### **Strategic Plan of the Province in El Salvador**

The council reviewed the updated Strategic Plan for Province in El Salvador. Included in the highlights were the formation and vocation efforts, finances and growing a donor base for the Asociacion Nuestra Señora del Carmen, and establishing a Carmelite identity in the various ministries.

Besides the seven professed members present in El Salvador, the four interns participated in the meeting by internet.

The provincial council applauds the efforts of the members of the province in El Salvador for their work these past three years to develop and implement the Strategic Plan.

## **New Business**

### **Financial Department Report**

The third quarter financials for the general balance statement and the balance statement by fund, as well as the general income statement and the income statement by funds, were presented and reviewed by the council.

The council also reviewed the proposed budgets (Operations, General, and Senior Fund) for 2017 – 2018 fiscal year.

**Motion: Joseph Atcher made a motion to approve the proposed budget for the 2017-2018 fiscal year. Samuel Citero seconded the motion. The motion unanimously approved the council.**

During the Inter-Provincial meeting of June 2017, both councils discussed the increasing cost of formation at Whitefriars Hall and Brandsma Priory. The goal was to find a more equitable contribution by both provinces to the houses of formation. To this end, Paul Denault, the SEL Provincial treasurer, submitted a proposal that was reviewed by the council. The two proposals were as follows: 1) To not change the current arrangement of \$1,000.00; or 2) Increase the contribution of each student to \$1,500.00 each month. After careful consideration, the council made a motion.

**Motion #3: Emilio Rodriguez motioned to accept proposal #2 – to increase the contribution for each student to \$1,500.00. Samuel Citero seconded the motion. The motion carried with a unanimous vote by the council.**

### **Carmelite Mission Office Funding Requests**

The mission office received a request from David Blanchard to purchase a new vehicle. Details of the purchase were discussed.

**Motion: William Harry motioned to approve the request. Samuel Citero seconded the motion. The motion unanimously passed.**

### **Petitions for Solemn Vows and Ordination**

Luis Jesus Paz petitioned for solemn vows. After reviewing evaluations from his former novice director and the professed members of Xiberta Center, the council unanimously approved his solemn vows (5-0) as Myron Judy was absent from the meeting.

Benjamin Salas petitioned for priesthood ordination. After a discussion, including the review of the evaluations for Benjamin, the Council voted 6-0, approving his petition.

Anthony Armstrong petitioned for priesthood ordination. The process for evaluation will include Joseph Wu, pastor of St. Raphael, members of the St. Raphael's Parish Community, as well as the OLMC community in Encino where Anthony is a member.

### **Membership**

<b>Frank McAleese,</b> Irish Province	Nuestra Señora del Carmen Parish José Gálvez, Peru		May 12, 2017
<b>Joseph Atcher</b>	Carith House Director, Pre-Novitiate Program	Chicago	June 1, 2017
<b>Tom Murphy</b>	Carith House	Chicago	July 1, 2017
<b>Glenn Snow</b>	Caretaker for the Long Beach, Indiana Cottage		June 1, 2017
<b>Peter McGarry</b>	Prior, Titus Brandsma House	Darien, IL	May 4, 2017
<b>Benjamin Salas</b>	Diaconate Ordination	San Salvador, ES	August 11, 2017
<b>Luis Jesus Paz</b>	Solemn Profession	San Salvador, ES	August 12, 2017

<b>Jeffrey Lima</b>	Whitefriars Hall	Washington, DC	June 1, 2017
<b>Manuel Pérez Demetrio</b>	Novitiate	Middletown, NY	June 1, 2017
<b>Adrian Hernández Ramírez</b>	Novitiate	Middletown, NY	June 1, 2017
<b>Horacio Diaz-Torres</b>	Novitiate	Middletown, NY	June 1, 2017
<b>Stephan Rochefort</b>	Novitiate	Middletown, NY	June 1, 2017

**Carlos Valdez** has been laicized by the Holy Father and has left the Order.

### **Co-Sponsored Schools**

**Joliet Catholic Academy - Joliet**  
**Carmel High School – Mundelein**

The provincial council discussed various matters in the two co-sponsored schools presented by the respective Board member from those schools.

### **Upcoming Events Around the Province and Order**

**Investiture of Novices – Middletown, NY**

June 11, 2017 | 7 PM

**Profession of SEL Novices – Middletown, NY**

June 12, 2017 | 10 AM

**Provincial Chapter – Niagara Falls, ON**

June 19-23, 2017

### **Upcoming Provincial Council Meeting Dates and Places**

Sunday, June 18, 2017 – Niagara Falls, ON

**Board of Members**  
**Crespi Carmelite High School**  
**May 5, 2017**

Members present: William Harry, President, Joseph Atcher, Samuel Citero, Emilio Rodriguez, and Paul Henson. Absent: Myron Judy.

The minutes of the February 14, 2017 Board of Directors meeting were reviewed.

The Board of Members discussed the visitation of February 2017 evaluation report. The report is based on face-to-face interviews with faculty and staff as well as information from an online survey of the parents. The President of the Board of Members will forward the Board's final report to the school administration.

The Board of Members reviewed the results of an evaluation of the President of Crespi Carmelite. We congratulate Dr. Foersch for a successful first year at Crespi Carmelite.

The Board of Members reviewed both the resume and the press release statement announcing Crespi's new principal, Dr. Liam Joyce, PhD.

The Board of Members approved the slate of Candidates for the 2017 Board of Directors. The new members are:

Pat Baker  
Bob Barberie  
MaryBeth Lutz  
Erin McClure  
Craig Russell  
Robert Slingerland

The projected enrollment at Crespi Carmelite for the 2017-2018 school year is 490-500.

The meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,  
Paul Henson, O. Carm.  
Board Secretary

**Board of Members**  
**Salpointe Catholic High School**  
**May 5, 2017**

Members present: William Harry, President, Joseph Atcher, Samuel Citero, Emilio Rodriguez, and Paul Henson. Absent: Myron Judy.

The minutes of the February 10, 2017 Board of Directors meeting were presented. Of concern to the board is the possibility that Arizona's tuition tax credit may be revised and reduced. This tuition tax credit is money that flows from the state government to Salpointe and is so significant that it funds the school's financial aid program. The financial experts on the board are following this development.

The 2017-2018 enrollment projected for the school is 1170-1200.

The meeting adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,  
Paul Henson, O. Carm.  
Board Secretary



**Board of Members  
Mt. Carmel High School  
May 5, 2017**

Members present: William Harry, President, Joseph Atcher, Samuel Citero, Emilio Rodriguez, and Paul Henson. Absent: Myron Judy.

The minutes for the February 21 and April 11 Board of Directors meetings as well as the dashboards for both months were presented and reviewed.

A significant amount of time was spent discussing the Board of Members Evaluation Report. The President of the Board of Members will send a letter to the President of Mount Carmel highlighting the strengths of the school, and improvements that the school should focus on.

Projected enrollment for the 2017-2018 school year is 600.

The meeting adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,  
Paul Henson, O. Carm.  
Board Secretary